

Relevant person	Investigation	Date decision notice was given	Commissioner's findings and determinations
<u>Wrexham</u> <u>County Borough</u> <u>Council</u>	<b>CS1232</b> It is suspected that Wrexham County Borough Council does not assess the linguistic needs for vacant or new posts relating to services provided on its behalf by Freedom Leisure, in accordance with standard 136. This also raised suspicion in relation to standards 136A and 137.	31/01/2025	<p><b>Commissioner's Findings</b></p> <p>The Council has failed to comply with standards 136, 136A and 137 when Freedom Leisure advertises leisure posts on its behalf.</p> <p>It is also suspected that the web pages relating to the advertising of those posts do not fully comply with standard 52. The Council has failed to comply with standard 52 as the Welsh side of the website included text in English only.</p> <p>Standard 52 – Failure            Standard 136 – Failure            Standard 136A - Failure            Standard 137 – Failure</p> <p><b>Further Action</b></p> <p>Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Measure</p> <p>Standard 52:</p> <p>1. The Council must check the web pages for post advertisements on the Freedom Leisure website to ensure that they comply fully with standard 52. The Council must ensure that no text or words appear in English only on the Welsh language web pages.</p>

Chief Constable  
of Dyfed Powys  
Police

**CS1267** The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public regarding the failure of Aberystwyth police station to provide a service through the medium of Welsh. The complainant called at the police station on Sunday 9 June 2024 when the reception was closed. As a police officer happened to be leaving the station, they offered to assist the complainant. As he could not get a Welsh language service when

10/01/2025

2. The Council must ensure that online application forms provided by the responsible third party are available in Welsh in order to comply with standard 52.
3. The Council must provide the Welsh Language Commissioner with sufficient written evidence that enforcement actions 1 and 2 have been completed. Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the final determination.

Standard 136, 136A and 137:

4. The Council must adjust its arrangements with Freedom Leisure to cover the relevant requirements of the recruitment standards when Freedom Leisure advertises posts relevant to leisure services provided on behalf of the Council.
5. The Council must provide the Welsh Language Commissioner with sufficient written evidence that enforcement action has been completed. Timetable: Within 12 months of issuing the final determination.

**Commissioner's Findings**

The relevant requirements in question are standards 21, 61 and 64. Having considered the information received from the complainant and the organisation, we are of the opinion that the Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police has failed to comply with standard 21 by returning the complainant's call in English despite there being a record on the police's system that the complainant's language choice is Welsh. We did not believe that there was a failure to comply with standards 61 and 64 on the basis

visiting the police station on 9 June 2024, he left and said that he called the 101 number to report a car accident. On 17 June 2024, he received a call back from the police in English to discuss the incident, and further calls in English on 14 September 2024.

that there was no reception service available as the reception was closed.

Standard 21 – Failure  
Standard 61 – Failure  
Standard 64 – Failure

### **Further Action**

Standard 21 – Requirement to take action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

1. After amending the way in which language choice is recorded on the police's STORM system, the Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police must:

i) inform staff who are responsible for answering the telephone of this change  
ii) organise a staff awareness session for staff responsible for answering the telephone of the importance of checking the language choice of anyone who contacts the police.

2. The Chief Constable of Dyfed Powys Police must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that he has completed enforcement action 1.

Timetable: Within 6 months of issuing the final determination.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

Following consideration of the evidence gathered by the surveys and the information received from the health board, we consider that the health board has failed to comply with standard 45. We recognise that the health board has prepared an action plan to address the issues

Aneurin Bevan  
University  
Health Board

**CS1282** My officers' monitoring work raised the suspicion that Aneurin Bevan University Health Board's corporate accounts on Facebook and X did not comply with standard 45. The failures included posts on the English language

20/12/2024

account without any corresponding Welsh language versions, less information in the Welsh language posts, and less information within the overall text on the accounts.

within this investigation. With that in mind, we have not imposed any enforcement action on Aneurin Bevan University Health Board. Instead, they are provided with advice under section 77(4) of the Measure.

Standard 45 – Failure

### **Further Action**

Advice in accordance with section 77(4) of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

We advise the health board to consider whether their message publishing arrangements on their social accounts need to be reviewed to ensure that all their messages comply with standard 45. Those arrangements could include:

- Prepare a guide, or amend a guideline already in place, which sets out a process to follow for publishing Welsh messages on social accounts. That guide could include arrangements on translation and test reading, preparing the English and Welsh text simultaneously before publication and using hashtags.

**CS1270** The Commissioner received a complaint regarding the email title and sender's name on a newsletter email from Transport for Wales. The complainant was unhappy that the title could not be seen in Welsh without opening the email and was unhappy that the sender's name was in English only.

20/12/2024

### **Commissioner's Findings**

The Welsh Ministers provided information which indicated that they were endeavouring to shorten the title to ensure that the English and Welsh title could be seen at the same time. They also noted that they had changed the sender name to show "Transport for Wales Trafnidiaeth Cymru" rather than "Transport for Wales".

Welsh Ministers

Powys County  
Council

**CS1193 & CS1251** I received complaints from a member of the public regarding Powys Council's alleged failure to publish Council documents and Cabinet decisions in Welsh on the Council's main website.

10/12/2024

Having considered the information received from the complainant and the organisation, I am of the view that the organisation has failed to comply with standards 6 and 83. As the organisation has taken steps to correct the failure, I will not be imposing further actions in relation to the failure to comply with standard 83.

Standard 6 – Failure

Standard 83 – Failure

### **Further Action**

Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

1. The Welsh Ministers must ensure that newsletter titles sent by Transport for Wales do not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English.
2. The Welsh Ministers must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that they have completed enforcement action 1.

Timetable: Within 1 month of issuing the final determination.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

Following initial correspondence with the Council, it agreed to amend its internal procedures for preparing these documents. At that time, I decided not to investigate further, as the Council's proposal would restore compliance with the standards.

However, following the Council's failure to adopt the new working procedure and a subsequent complaint regarding similar issues concerning the failure to provide Council

Cabinet documents and decisions, I decided to open an inquiry into both matters and consider them together in one report.

In response to the complainant's complaint, the Council acknowledged that it had not complied with the relevant standards. The Council did not explain its reasons for failing to comply but noted that a new procedure had since been established whereby machine translation and artificial intelligence are used to translate documents and Cabinet decisions, which are then verified by a qualified translator before being uploaded to the Council's website.

As a result, despite finding non-compliance, I will not take further action or impose enforcement measures on the Council because the new procedure voluntarily established by the Council is sufficient to restore its compliance with the standards.

As a result, despite finding failure, I originally decided not to act further and impose enforcement actions on the Council, placing faith in the Council that it had voluntarily established an adequate regime to restore compliance with the standards.

Following sending my draft report to the Council however, it became clear that the Council was still not publishing the documents in question on their website at the same time as the English versions. Having corresponded further with the Council, although they have been aware of this investigation for some time, it has become clear that they have not put in place adequate procedures to ensure

Hywel Dda  
University  
Health Board

**CS1279** On July 2024, my officers checked the health board's main hospital telephone lines. Contrary to the requirements of standard 9, callers were not informed that a Welsh language service was available on its telephone numbers.

06/12/2024

compliance with the Standards in question. As a result, I must now impose enforcement actions on the Council.

Standard 40 – Failure  
Standard 47 - Failure  
Standard 52 – Failure

### **Further Action**

1. The Council must ensure that, from the date of this Decision Notice, they have a procedure whereby the Council's agendas, minutes, documents and decisions are produced in Welsh.
2. The Council must ensure that the Welsh language material in Enforcement Action 1 is not treated less favourably than the English language material including in terms of when and how the material is published on their website.
3. The Council must provide written evidence satisfying the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 1 – 2 within 1 month of issuing the final determination.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

The health board's evidence confirmed that it does not currently have adequate arrangements to ensure it informs persons of the availability of a Welsh language service.

The survey results showed that the health board failed to deal with the calls in Welsh in accordance with the requirements of standard 10. The health board confirmed that only a limited number of its call handlers speak Welsh

and that there is currently no telephony system to transfer callers to a Welsh language telephone service although there are plans to do so in the future.

Standard 9 – Failure

Standard 10 – Failure

### **Further Action**

Standards 9 and 10: Requirement to prepare an action plan in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

I require Hywel Dda University Health Board to prepare an action plan for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the health board's failure to comply with standards 9 and 10.

The body is expected to prepare and complete the plan in accordance with the general guidance contained in *"Advice Document: A guide for preparing an action plan following a determination of a failure to comply with Welsh language standards."*

The action plan must include a description of each of the steps the health board will take to ensure that when a person contacts the health board on its relevant telephone numbers:

- the health board informs the person that a Welsh language service is available, in accordance with the requirements of standard 9;



- that the health board, in accordance with the requirements of standard 10, deals with the call in Welsh if the person so wishes until such point as—
  - a) it is necessary to transfer the call to a member of staff who does not speak Welsh who can provide a service on a specific subject matter; and
  - b) no Welsh speaking member of staff is available to provide a service on that specific subject matter.

The action plan must include

- a timetable for the delivery of each of the steps, with each of the steps to be completed by the end of July 2025;
- who will be responsible and accountable for implementing each of the actions set out in the plan;
- who from the Senior Management Team is responsible for scrutinising the health board's progress against the action plan;
- a description of the supervisory arrangements adopted to ensure the achievement of the plan;
- the resources (e.g. funding/staff) needed to carry out each of the actions.

### **Standard 9**

The action plan is expected to include steps to ensure that—

- all the health board's relevant telephone numbers inform persons calling that a Welsh language service is available on the telephone, at all times during the call as expected in accordance with standard 9.

This includes ensuring that the health board informs callers that a Welsh language service is available on the telephone:

- at the start of any call (e.g. informing callers via an automated telephone system and/or the staff member answering the call informing the caller and/or the staff member immediately starting the conversation in Welsh), and
- where a staff member transfers the call to another member of staff (who can provide a service on the specific subject matter of the call in Welsh).
- if the health board does not comply with standard 9 in any other way, that the health board establishes an automated telephone system on the telephone number which informs all callers at the start of the call that a Welsh language service is available on the telephone, by providing them with the option of receiving a Welsh (or English) language service by pressing a specific number on the telephone.
- that all guidance provided to staff to ensure they are operating in accordance with standard 9 requirements, clarifies the steps staff must take in a telephone call in order to fully meet the duties of standard 9.

This includes ensuring that all guidance communicates the following:

- how and when staff, who answer calls on telephone numbers where the call is answered directly by a staff member (and not by an automated telephone system), must inform persons that there is a Welsh language service available on the telephone (if that

- is not already clear to the person because the staff member has immediately started the conversation with the person in Welsh),
- how and when staff must inform callers that a Welsh language service will continue to be available on the telephone when the staff member transfers the call to another member of staff (who is able to provide a service on the specific subject matter of the call in Welsh).

### **Standard 10**

The action plan is expected to include steps to ensure that—

- if a person contacts one of health board's main relevant telephone numbers, the health board must deal with the call in Welsh if that is the person's wish until such point as—
  - a) it is necessary to transfer the call to a member of staff who does not speak Welsh who can provide a service on a specific subject matter; and
  - b) no Welsh speaking member of staff is available to provide a service on that specific subject matter.

This includes ensuring the following if the person wishes the call to be dealt with in Welsh:

- (following giving the initial greeting to the person in Welsh in accordance with standard 8), any other greetings the health board makes to that person during the call are made in Welsh;
- that the member of staff answering the call is able to establish the nature of the call, hold an initial conversation and deal with any query that does not

- relate to a "specific subject" (e.g. a general enquiry), in Welsh;
- that the call is not transferred by the member of staff answering the call to another member of staff to deal with in Welsh, before the call requires a "specific subject" to be dealt with (e.g. a specialist matter);
  - once the call requires a "specific subject" to be dealt with, and the member of staff answering the call is unable to deal with the specific subject in Welsh themselves, the health board must check whether there is a member of staff available who can deal with the specific subject matter of the call in Welsh, and if one is available, the call handler transfers the call to that staff member to deal with the specific subject in Welsh.
  - the health board ensures that all relevant staff responsible for dealing with Welsh language calls to its relevant telephone numbers have Welsh language skills that enable them to deal with telephone calls in Welsh in accordance with standard 10 (e.g. by improving the Welsh language skills of existing staff to a level that ensures this).
  - the health board amends all its procedures, policies and guidelines (and other relevant documents) relevant to compliance with standard 10 to ensure that all the requirements of standard 10 are clearly and accurately reflected.

This includes, but is not limited to, amending all guidance given to staff to ensure they are operating in accordance with the requirements of standard 10.

**CS1222** The investigation has considered the alleged failure of Cardiff Council (the Council) to provide a website and app for leisure services through the medium of Welsh. The investigation has also considered the Council's failure to offer swimming lessons for adults through the medium of Welsh.

Cardiff Council

05/12/2025

**Timetable:**

The health board must produce a first draft of the action plan and provide that draft to the Commissioner within 2 months from the date of publication of the Commissioner's final determination.

By 4 weeks from the date of implementing the final action included in the action plan, the health board must provide written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has carried out each of the actions in the action plan.

**Commissioner's Findings**

Greenwich Leisure Limited provide the Council's Leisure Services website and app on their behalf. The Council has accepted that they have failed to provide a fully functioning website and app for leisure services through the medium of Welsh. There was a general clause in their agreement with the company about the need for these services to comply with Welsh Language Standards. However, the Council has accepted that there was insufficient detail about that requirement in the agreement and that the Council did not take specific steps to verify and ensure compliance of those services with Welsh Language Standards. The Council has also accepted that they have not offered swimming lessons for adults in Welsh although they offer swimming lessons for adults in English. The Council accepts that they had not offered a course in Welsh although no assessment of the need for such a course was made.

Standard 52 – Failure

Standard 56 – Failure  
Standard 57 – Failure  
Standard 84 – Failure  
Standard 86 – Failure

### **Further Action**

Standards 52, 56 and 57: A requirement to take action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

1. The Council must ensure that the website [www.better.org.uk](http://www.better.org.uk) and the 'Better UK' app functions fully in Welsh and the Council must work with Greenwich Leisure Limited to ensure compliance with the Welsh Language Standards.
2. The Council must create a procedure whereby the website and app are checked by the Council to ensure full compliance with Welsh Language Standards. The procedure should ensure that any errors raised with Greenwich Leisure Limited are corrected within a specified period. The procedure should outline that the website and app are reviewed weekly by the Council until the website is fully operational in Welsh. The verification period can be extended after that point.

Timetable: Within 6 months from the date of publication of the final judgement. 3. The Council must provide an update on their progress on the implementation of Enforcement Step 1 after 3 months.

Standards 84 and 86: A requirement to take action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

The Council must update their procedures so that they assess the need for a Welsh medium course in accordance with Standard 86 each time the Council develops an education course to be offered to the public. The Council must ensure that relevant staff receive training on this new procedure and on how to make such an assessment.

5. The Council must carry out an assessment of the need for a swimming course for adults through the medium of Welsh and ensure that the assessment is published on the organisation's website in accordance with Standard 84.

Timetable: Within 3 months from the date of publication of the final judgement.

6. If the assessment under Enforcement Action 5 finds that the course in question needs to be conducted in Welsh, the Council must identify a Welsh-medium qualified swimming instructor.

Timetable: Within 6 months from the date of publication of the final judgement.

7. The Council must provide written evidence to the satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 3 — 5 within three months and enforcement actions 1 — 2 and 6 within 6 months of the date of publication of the final determination.

**CS1257** I received a complaint from a member of the public that webinars on the Future Proofing Fund were held in English only on the Business Wales website on the 9th and 14th of May 2024.

Welsh Ministers

26/11/2024

Recommendation in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

8. We recommend that the Council tried to identify a suitable swimming coach in their usual way but also to make a further attempt by, for example, contacting Universities, Colleges or sports groups directly about the role. If the Council assigns a new role the Council should consider offering Welsh language training as part of the job. The Council should also assess whether existing swimming tutors would be able to attend a Welsh training course to develop their ability to offer swimming courses in Welsh.

#### **Commissioner's Findings**

Business Wales implements the Welsh Ministers' Welsh language standards. Business Wales confirmed that the webinars were held in English only, despite Welsh language resources being available. Business Wales also confirmed that other webinars are being held by them in English only, and not offered through the medium of Welsh.

Standard 84 requires that the Welsh Ministers ensure that when they offer an education course that is open to the public, they must offer the course in Welsh. As the education courses organised by Business Wales were conducted in English only, and not offered in Welsh, the Welsh Ministers are determined to have failed to comply with Standard 84.

Standard 84 – Failure



Welsh Ministers

**CS1265 & CS1273** I received complaints from two complainants regarding announcements that were made in English only at Bangor train station on various occasions between January and May 2024. The train station's automatic announcements were bilingual, but voice announcements made by staff were in English only.

21/11/2024

### **Further Action**

The Welsh Ministers must ensure that the education courses organised by Business Wales for the public are offered in Welsh. It must be made clear to users of the service that these education courses are available in Welsh. The Welsh Ministers must provide sufficient written evidence to satisfy the Welsh Language Commissioner that they have carried out the enforcement action.

Timetable: Within 6 weeks of issuing the final determination

### **Commissioner's Findings**

Transport for Wales (TfW) stated that some announcements at Bangor train station, and at other train stations, are made by staff. Not all staff who make live announcements are confident when announcing in Welsh and therefore some announcements are made in English only.

TfW implement the standards of the Welsh Ministers.

Standard 87 requires the Welsh Ministers to ensure when a message is announced over a public address system, that announcement should be made in Welsh and, if the announcement is made in Welsh and in English, the announcement must be made in Welsh first. Some announcements by staff at train stations are made in English only. Therefore, it is determined that the Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 87.

Rhondda Cynon  
Taf County  
Borough Council

**CS1239** The complainant used the 'Dywedwch wrthym Unwaith' (Tell Us Once) service, which is a service partly provided by county councils on behalf of the Department for Work and Pensions. The complainant alleges that she received correspondence from Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council's Council Tax Department in English only after using that service, despite indicating her desire to do everything through the medium of Welsh.

24/10/2024

## Standard 87 - Failure

### Further Action

1. The Welsh Ministers must prepare an action plan describing the steps they will take to ensure that live announcements made by the staff of all stations under their control comply with the requirements of standard 87. The plan must focus specifically on the steps they will take to ensure that Bangor station's announcements comply with the standard.
2. The Welsh Ministers must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed the enforcement action.

Timetable: Within 1 month of issuing the final determination.

### Commissioner's Findings

The relevant requirements in question are standards 2 and 5.

Standard 2 – Failure

Standard 5 – Failure

### Further Action

Standard 2 - Requirement to take action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

1. Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council must ensure that any correspondence that is produced

automatically, is produced in Welsh (e.g. letters regarding Council Tax). If the current system does not enable that, an alternative way of producing them in Welsh must be found in order to comply with the requirements of Welsh language standards and to send correspondence in accordance with the recipient's language choice where that is known.

2. Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council must provide sufficient written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that enforcement step 1 has been completed.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the final determination.

Standard 2 – Recommendation in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

1. I recommend that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council consider whether the statement that appears at the bottom of all correspondence is made in a way that is accessible to the reader, that is, whether it is sufficient for others to contact the individual in the future in their chosen language.

2. I recommend that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council consider whether the Council's arrangements for keeping a record of language choice are sufficient to enable others in the organization to find it should it be necessary to contact the complainant in the future.

Standard 5 – Recommendation in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure

**CS1247** I received a complaint from a member of the public about messages received from <https://www.journeycheck.com/tfwrail/> which is Transport for Wales' part of the Journeycheck site. Transport for Wales implement the standards of the Welsh Ministers. Some sections of the website were only available in English.

Welsh Ministers

19/09/2024

2011

3. I recommend that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council considers the need to raise its staff's awareness of the requirements of the standards in other departments of the Council, as has already been done with the Council's departments that are involved with the 'Tell Us Once' service.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

Standard 52 requires the Welsh Ministers to ensure that the text of each page of their website is available in Welsh and fully functional. They must also ensure that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language on those pages. As only some sections of the <https://www.journeycheck.com/tfwrail/> site are available in Welsh, the Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 52 in this case.

Standard 55 requires the Welsh Ministers to ensure, if there is a Welsh language web page that corresponds to an English language web page, they must state clearly on the English language web page that the page is also available in Welsh, and they must provide a direct link to the Welsh page on the corresponding English page. As there was no corresponding site available in Welsh to the <https://www.journeycheck.com/tfwrail/> site, I do not believe that the Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 55 in this case.

Standard 56 requires the Welsh Ministers to ensure that the interface and menus on every page of their website are available in Welsh. As the menus and interface are

not available in Welsh on the <https://www.journeycheck.com/tfwrail/> site, I believe that the Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 56.

Standard 52 – Failure

Standard 55 – No failure

Standard 56 – Failure

### **Further Action**

Requirement to prepare an action plan under section 77 of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

Standards 52 and 56

The Welsh Ministers must prepare an action plan to ensure that they comply with the requirements of standards 52 and 56. The draft action plan must include the following information:

- The steps that they will take to replace the <https://www.journeycheck.com/tfwrail/> site and deliver this service, including journey notifications, in compliance with standards 52 and 56.
- The steps that they will take to incorporate other sites relevant to the implementation of the Welsh language standards within the proposed digital programme.
- Who will be responsible and accountable for taking each step (including any milestones)
- The resources (e.g. finance/staff) required to complete each step.
- A timetable for achieving each step.

Welsh Ministers

**CS1207** I received a complaint from a member of the public regarding an educational event organised by the Seren Academy for school pupils. (The Seren Academy operates according to Welsh Ministers standards.) The educational event was held in English only, and all resources for the session were also in English only. The course was not offered in Welsh before being conducted in English.

05/08/2024

The Welsh Ministers must comply fully with the requirements of standards 52 and 56 in relation to the service provided currently by the JourneyCheck site by December 2025.

It is expected that any action plan will be prepared and completed in accordance with the guidance set out in this report as well as the general guidance available in the attached Advice Document.

Timetable:

The Welsh Ministers must produce an initial draft of the action plan and present it to the Commissioner within 1 month of the publication date of the Commissioner's final determination.

**Commissioner's Findings**

Standard 85 requires Welsh Ministers to ensure that when they offer an education course that is open to the public, and specifically aimed at persons aged 18 or under, the course is offered in Welsh. In this case, the education course was not conducted in Welsh, nor offered in Welsh before being delivered in English. It is therefore judged that the Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with Standard 85.

Standard 85 – Failure

**Further Action**

1. The Welsh Ministers must create an action plan that will demonstrate the steps they proposed to take to restore full compliance and address the following issues;

Newport City  
Council

**CS1199** I received a complaint from a member of the public regarding an alleged failure by the Council to provide information about Cabinet and Council decisions on the Council's Welsh website.

02/08/2024

- How the Seren Academy plans to go about offering the courses to pupils in the future;
  - Review arrangements for the commissioning of educational sessions to ensure that the sessions can be held in accordance with the requirement of the standard;
  - Review the guidance provided to regional staff to ensure that they are aware of the requirements of the standards and expectations for offering courses in Welsh;
  - Highlight what steps can be taken to improve Welsh language provision across the programme of activities.
2. The Welsh Ministers must provide written evidence satisfying the Welsh Language Commissioner that they have completed the enforcement action within 2 months from the date of the final award being published.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

The Council failed to provide information about Council agendas and minutes on the Council's Welsh website contrary to the requirements of standard 41.

Contrary to the requirements of standard 52, not all Welsh pages that were checked were fully functional. Also, several instances were observed where Welsh was treated less favorably than English on these websites.

Furthermore, not all English pages that were checked included a direct link leading to the corresponding Welsh page. This was an example of the Council's failure to comply with the requirements of standard 55.

On the Welsh side of the website, the interface and menus were not available (in Welsh) on some pages that were checked. As a result, the Council also failed to comply with standard 56.

Standard 41 – Failure

Standard 52 – Failure

Standard 55 – Failure

Standard 56 – Failure

### **Further Action**

Standards 41, 52, 55 a 56: Requirement to take action under section 77 Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011

1. The Council must ensure that records (including the Decision Register) relating to Cabinet and Council meetings are fully prepared and available on the Council's website in Welsh.
3. The Council must conduct regular audits of its websites to identify and correct any errors and inconsistencies between the Welsh and English websites.
4. The Council must review its content management processes to ensure that it is not possible to publish or update a page (in English) on the English website without also publishing or updating the corresponding page (in Welsh) on the Welsh website simultaneously.
5. The Council must develop (and share with all relevant teams within the organisation) clear protocols and guidelines for creating, translating, and publishing bilingual content on its websites in accordance with the requirements of the standards.



**CS1197 & CS1206** I received a complaint from a member of the public who claimed that Denbigh Leisure Centre's Facebook page contained English-only posts/information.

Separately, I received comments from a member of the public about the Denbighshire Leisure Ltd (DLL) website, which included English-only swimming timetables. I contacted Denbighshire County Council twice regarding the matter, and although I had received confirmation from the Council's Language Officer that corrective work would be completed, the errors remained when the website was checked.

22/07/2024

6. The Council must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement action 1 to 5.

Timeline: Within 6 months from the date of issuing the final determination.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

As the complaint and comments touched upon similar issues, I decided to conduct a joint investigation into the two cases.

The relevant requirements under investigation are standards 58 and 52.

Glossary of terms for organisations concerned:

- Denbighshire County Council – Owner of Denbighshire Leisure Ltd.
- Denbighshire Leisure Ltd (DLL) – An independent legal entity owned by Denbighshire County Council, which provides a leisure service on behalf of the Council.
- Denbigh Leisure Centre – a Leisure Centre managed by DLL.

Standard 58 – Failure

Standard 52 – Failure

### **Further Action**

#### Standard 58

1. The Council must create a guide or guidance for staff responsible for its social websites regarding

**CS1234** I received a complaint from a member of the public who claimed that the consultation on the 2024-25 Vale of Glamorgan Council budget did not include any reference to the Welsh language, nor did it seek public opinion about the possible effects of the

11/07/2024

the requirements of the Welsh language standards (including standard 58) and distribute it to the relevant staff.

2. The Council must monitor a sample of 10 posts on the Denbigh Leisure Centre Facebook page within a three-month period and contact Denbighshire Leisure Ltd if the Council finds any problems complying with Welsh language standards.

#### Standard 52

3. The Council must ensure that all timetables on the Denbighshire Leisure Ltd website are available in Welsh (this includes swimming timetables, the junior membership schedule, and class timetables).

4. The Council must monitor a sample of 10 daytime timetables on the Denbighshire Leisure Ltd website (this can include swimming timetables, the junior membership timetable, and a class timetables), within a three-month period.

5. Denbighshire County Council must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement steps 1–4.

#### **Commissioner's Findings**

The relevant requirements under investigation are standards 91, 92 and 93.

The investigation showed that there had been no consideration of the impact of the policy decision on the Welsh language, and no questions were asked to seek the views of the public about possible effects on the

proposed budget decisions on the Welsh language.

Welsh language. This showed a failure to comply with standards 91, 92, and 93. Although the Council had intended to carry out an Equality Impact Assessment for the consultation, which would have included consideration of the Welsh language, this did not show compliance with the requirements of the standards.

Standards 91, 92 and 93- Failure

**Further Action**

1. The Council must create a guidance document (or add to guidance that already exists) which explains that the views of the public must be considered and sought on opportunities to use the Welsh language, and on not treating the Welsh language less favourably than English within consultation documents. The guidance document must set out all the requirements of standards 91, 92 and 93.
2. The Council must provide training for staff responsible for creating budgetary policy consultation documents. The training must raise staff awareness of all the requirements of standards 91, 92, and 93.
3. All members of staff responsible for creating consultation documents must be made aware of all the requirements of standards 91, 92 and 93.
4. The Vale of Glamorgan Council must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement actions 1-3.

Timetable: Within 3 months from the date of publication of the final determination.

Welsh Ministers

**CS1211** I received a complaint from a member of the public who had received a letter in English only from Transport Investigations, a company contracted to Transport for Wales. (Transport for Wales implement the standards of the Welsh Ministers.) The letter related to an incident on a train journey taken by the complainant in May 2023. The letter gave the complainant the opportunity to provide further details about the incident, and referred her to the Transport Investigations website for further information. The Transport Investigations website is available in English only and this information is not available in Welsh elsewhere.

09/07/2024

**Commissioner's Findings**

Standard 5 requires the Welsh Ministers to ensure that a Welsh version of correspondence is provided when correspondence is sent to a person on their behalf, and when they don't know whether the person wishes to receive correspondence in Welsh. As a Welsh version of the correspondence was not provided in this case, it is determined that the Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 5.

Standard 52 requires the Welsh Ministers to ensure that the text of each page of their website is available in Welsh. As information relevant to Transport for Wales customers is available on the Transport Investigations website in English only and the information is not available in Welsh elsewhere, it is determined that the Welsh Ministers have failed to comply with standard 52.

Standard 5 - Failure

Standard 52 – Failure

**Further Action**

The Welsh Ministers must prepare a draft action plan to ensure that they comply with the requirements of standard 5. The action plan must detail the discussions between Transport for Wales and Transport Investigations and:

- describe the steps they will take in order to comply with the requirements of Standard 5, and ensure that any correspondence sent on their behalf by Transport Investigations is sent in Welsh;
- describe the steps they will take in order to comply with Standard 52, and ensure that information relevant to

Blaenau Gwent  
County Borough  
Council

**CS1170** A complaint was received from a member of the public about Aneurin Leisure Trust's (the Trust) lack of use of the Welsh language:

- on its websites
- on its social media
- on some signs at sites which it manages.

The Trust delivers services which are promoted on these websites and social media accounts on behalf of Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council (the Council). It also controls the site where the signs were erected on behalf of the Council. The Council therefore has a duty to ensure that this provision complies with the Welsh language standards.

04/06/2024

Transport for Wales customers on the Transport Investigations website is available in Welsh, and that the information is as easily found in Welsh as in English;

- include a timeframe for carrying out the above steps.

Timeline:

The Welsh Ministers must produce an initial draft of the action plan and present it to the Commissioner within 2 months of the publication date of the Commissioner's final determination.

**Commissioner's Findings**

In this case, the following websites did not have Welsh language pages, contrary to the requirements of standard 52:

- the Trust's corporate website ([www.aneurinleisure.org.uk](http://www.aneurinleisure.org.uk))
- the website for BG Life leisure centres and services ([www.bglife.co.uk](http://www.bglife.co.uk))
- the Parc Bryn Bach website ([www.parcbrynbach.co.uk](http://www.parcbrynbach.co.uk))
- the Bedwellty House and Park website ([www.bedwelltyhouseandpark.com](http://www.bedwelltyhouseandpark.com))

The Trust's social media accounts published information and posts in English only. This was contrary to the requirements of standard 58.

Some English-only signs were placed at Parc Bryn Bach. This was contrary to the requirements of standard 61.

During the investigation, the Trust published a Welsh language version of its corporate website ([www.aneurinleisure.org.uk](http://www.aneurinleisure.org.uk)) and the BG Life website ([www.bglife.co.uk](http://www.bglife.co.uk)).

The Trust also replaced the English-only signs with bilingual ones and corrected the erroneous Welsh language text on the other signs.

Enforcement action was imposed to ensure that the Council addressed the other failures to comply, where it had not done so voluntarily.

Standards 52, 58 and 61 – Failure  
Standard 55 – No failure

### **Further Action**

Requirement to take steps in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

1. The Council must undertake a review to establish which of the following are delivered on its behalf by the Trust:

- Pages and information published on its websites
- Posts on its social media accounts
- Signs on display

Requirement to prepare an action plan in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure

2. Based on the findings of the review, the Council must prepare an action plan to ensure compliance with standards 52, 58 and 61.

3. The action plan must include the following

**CS1213** A complaint about a lack of Welsh language service on more than one occasion at the reception of Cardiff Central Library.

Cardiff Council

04/06/2024

information:

- A description of the steps that the Council will take to comply with the standards
- A timetable for completing the steps that the Council will take to comply with the standards.

The timetable should be no longer than 6 months from the date of approval of the plan.

- An explanation of who will be responsible and accountable for taking each step identified in the plan.
- Assurance that members of the Senior Management Team have a role in scrutinising progress.

Timetable: Within 3 months of issuing the final Determination.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

The relevant requirement for the investigation is standard 64. The Council confirms that there isn't a Welsh speaker working at the library reception at all times, and therefore it is not always possible to provide a reception service in Welsh. This is a failure to comply with standard 64. The Council has already put steps in place to encourage staff to learn Welsh, and a recruitment plan has been prepared for the coming months. As a result, I will not be taking further action in relation to the failure.

Standard 64 – Failure

### **Further Action**

#### Standard 64

No further action as a result of steps already in place by the Council to correct the failure.

The City and  
County of  
Swansea  
Council

**CS1209** I received a complaint from a member of the public alleging that she had received an email from Swansea Grand Theatre, containing a link to a survey in Welsh, which led to a web page in English. After this, the survey was removed from the website, and an English-only message appeared on the page stating that the window for responding to the survey had closed.

13/05/2024

### **Commissioner's Findings**

The relevant requirement in question is standard 50. As the Council submitted evidence confirming that a Welsh language version of the survey had been available, there had been no failure to comply with standard 50. However, I encourage the Council to ensure that it clearly states on the English versions of forms for public use that a Welsh version is also available.

Standard 50 – No failure

**CS1195** A complaint was received from the complainant regarding the registration process for registering a child in a school within the Council's catchment area. The registration process contained a number of errors when the complainant submitted the application on the Council's Welsh electronic registration form and website.

Wrexham  
County Borough  
Council

In particular, the complainant stated:

- That the Council's website and the application process for registering a child in a school were not available entirely in Welsh, although choosing Welsh schools was an option;
- She received confirmation of her child's enrollment in a Welsh-medium school in English only;
- The complainant's home address appeared on the fall curtain in English only, without a Welsh option; a

10/05/2024

### **Commissioner's Findings**

In this case, the website, the website options and the dropdown options on the application form for a place in a school on the Council's website treat the Welsh language less favorably and are contrary to the requirements of standard 52. The website and the application process for a place in a school within the Council's catchment area is also contrary to the requirements of standard 56. In addition, the correspondence the complainant received confirming a place for her child, despite completing the form in Welsh, is in English only and contrary to the requirements of standard 4.

Standard 4 – Failure

Standard 50 and 50B – Failure

Standard 52 and 56 – Failure

### **Further Action**

#### Standard 4:

1. Wrexham County Borough Council must raise staff



- That the Council only submitted standard correspondence in English without any correspondence in Welsh, even though the complainant submitted the application in Welsh on the Council's website

awareness of the need to send correspondence to more than one person bilingually on all occasions.

Standard 50 and 50B:

2. Wrexham County Borough Council must check all its e-forms to ensure that all forms are available in Welsh and that the forms do not treat Welsh less favorably than English.

Standard 52 and 56:

3. Wrexham County Borough Council must take steps to ensure that the Council's online services are published on its website in Welsh and English, including drop down options and headings on sections of the Council's website and any online forms used by the Council.

All Standards:

Wrexham County Borough Council must carry out a review of its arrangements and procedures and the way it checks and proofread websites, online forms and any registration process ensuring accuracy and consistency in the Welsh version and the Version English from the same document.

Following the review, I require Wrexham County Borough Council to prepare a findings report and include a section about the lessons learned from carrying out the review and what changes need to be introduced to the Council's procedures in preparing and reviewing announcements and options/drop down menus on the Council's website. Practical advice must

Carmarthenshire  
County Council

**CS1172** I received a complaint alleging that new road markings in the County contained text in English only. The text in question was 'Town Centre', 'East' and 'West'.

Carmarthenshire  
County Council

**CS1201** The complainant alleges that a Welsh-language electoral registration notice sent by Carmarthenshire County Council included his home address in English. A screenshot was provided of the notice in question which confirmed this.

12/04/2024

also be produced explaining to staff how to plan and operate in Welsh when providing such services to the public.

#### **Commissioner's Findings**

This created a suspicion of failure to comply with standard 61. A standard translation for 'Town Centre' is prescribed in the Welsh Government guidelines. By not using that translation, the Council has failed to comply with standard 61. There is no Welsh version of 'East' and 'West' in the guidelines, and therefore the Council has no right to use 'Gorllewin' and 'Dwyrain'. This is because that would be contrary to the relevant Legislation, and therefore the Council is exempt from the requirements of the standard in accordance with paragraph 25 of Part 3 of Schedule 1 of the Welsh Language Standards (No.1) Regulations 2015.

Standard 61 – Failure (No further action).

#### **Commissioner's Findings**

The relevant requirements in question are standards 4 and 6. After receiving evidence from the Council, the correspondence in question treats the Welsh language less favourably as the complainant's address is not listed in Welsh, despite the fact that the street where the complainant's home is located is registered in Welsh by the Council. This is contrary to the requirements of standard 6.

Having considered the Council's evidence, it appears that the complainant's complaint is due to an issue with the

**CS1202** I received a complaint from a member of the public who claimed that the Welsh names of electoral wards were misspelled on the Council's website, and English-only text appeared on pages that provided information about the Council's councillors. This is the second time the

11/04/2024

postal addresses used by the Council's software providers. This is beyond the Council's control. As a result, the most practical way of addressing the issue highlighted by the Council is to enter into a settlement agreement and find a way of ensuring the most positive change in relation to the software.

Consequently, despite finding a failure, I will not take further action or impose enforcement action on the Council. I will ask my officers to contact the software company, IDOX as well as the Royal Mail for their response to these findings and to consider a solution to the situation that will ensure the Council's compliance with the Welsh Language Standards. I also recommend that my officers carry out an exercise to gather information from all local authorities in Wales regarding their current arrangements when preparing electoral registration correspondence in order to understand how local authorities prepare and create electoral registration correspondence which complies with the Welsh Language Standards.

Standard 4 – Failure

Standard 6 – No failure

### **Commissioner's Findings**

The relevant requirement under investigation is standard 52. In this case, the page in question on the Council's website has treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language for the reasons stated by the complainant in the complaint, contrary to the requirements of standard 52.

complainant has submitted a complaint about this matter. It was decided not to investigate the first complaint following commitments from the Council to tackle the issue.

Powys County Council

**CS1171** There are two elements to this complaint. Firstly, the complainant alleges that there were English-only announcements on the public address system of a Traws Cymru bus between Newtown and Cardiff on 05/07/2023, as well as announcements where the Welsh language followed the English language on the public address system. Secondly,

10/04/2024

Standard 52 – Failure

### **Further Action**

#### Standard 52:

1. Flintshire County Council must check the correct spelling of the name of each County electoral ward on its website.
2. The Council must once again distribute its support package for bilingual software developers to all relevant members of staff, drawing the specific attention of staff to the requirement to ensure that "linguistic quality should be at the same level for both languages" (clause 1.3 of the package).
3. The Council must monitor a sample of 10 pages on its website within a year, to ensure that the Welsh content is correct in accordance with the requirements of standard 52.
4. Flintshire County Council must provide written evidence that satisfies the Welsh Language Commissioner that it has completed enforcement steps 1-3.

### **Commissioner's Findings**

The relevant requirements under investigation relate to Standards 87, 61 and 62. In this case, the Welsh language has been treated less favourably than the English language in the public address system announcements of the bus service between Newtown and Cardiff, which is contrary to the requirements of standard 87. Furthermore, the Welsh language was treated less favourably than the English language due to incorrect

the complainant alleges that the Welsh language appeared after the English language on the digital screen of the bus service between Newtown and Cardiff.

Welsh text on the bus service's digital screens, contrary to the requirements of standard 61. There was however no failure to comply with standard 62 as the text was displayed on a loop.

Standard 87 – Failure

Standard 61 – Failure

Standard 62 – No failure

### **Further Action**

#### Standard 87:

1. Powys County Council must create a guidance document for its staff and bus service contractors which explains the requirements of standard 87 in relation to public address system announcements, and draw the attention of the relevant staff and contractors to that document.
2. The Council must create a checking procedure for observing the compliance of the bus service with the requirements of the Welsh language standards, including standards 87 and 61.
3. The Council must check the accuracy of a sample of the names of fifteen bus-stops displayed on the digital screens of the T4 bus service, within a period of 3 months. This is relevant only to bus-stops on the T4 service which fall under the responsibility of the Council.

#### Standard 61:

4. The Council must check the accuracy of the Welsh names of all bus-stops on the T4 bus service within a period of three months, and correct any

incorrect names that are identified. This is relevant only to bus-stops on the T4 service which fall under the responsibility of the Council.