

Relevant person	Investigation	Date decision notice was given	Commissioner's findings and determinations
<u>Cardiff Council</u>	<p>The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public that satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant stated that the online change of address form for Council Tax, which is on City of Cardiff Council's website, was not available in Welsh. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standard 50.</p>	21/3/2017	<p><b>Commissioner's findings</b>  The change of address, disability relief and change of tenant online forms for Council Tax had been available in English since 2007, and therefore the Council had produced the forms before the imposition day. However, the Council stated in its evidence that the change of address form was not available in Welsh until 16/12/2016. The Council also stated that the disability relief and change of tenant forms were not available in Welsh until 02/12/2016. This means that the Council did not comply with the requirements of standard 50 in relation to these three forms between the imposition day (30/03/2016) and December 2016.</p> <p><b>Commissioner's determination</b>  Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 50.</p> <p><b>Statement of further action</b></p>

The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 Welsh Language Measure.

**Statement on the further action**

The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure: The Council should continue with its arrangements for ensuring that it complies with the requirements of Welsh language standards in relation to forms and documents, and in relation to websites, online services and social media, and it should review those arrangements regularly to ensure that they are effective. In connection with those arrangements, the Council should ensure that forms are checked as part of the audits conducted to ensure compliance with the standards. When shortcomings are made apparent as a result of audits, the Council should take action to comply with the standards.

**Decision notice given**

The decision notice was presented to the Council on 21/03/2017.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the tribunal.

Cardiff Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a person on 10/06/2016 that met the conditions of section 93 (3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleged that they did not receive a reception service in Welsh

1/3/2017

**Commissioner's findings**

The Council's response suggests that the reception staff did not greet the complainant in Welsh or offer them a Welsh language reception service on 7 June 2016. Furthermore, the complainant did not receive a Welsh language service as they had wished on 7 June. The

whilst visiting the Council's main office at Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff Bay on the afternoon of 7 June 2016. The complainant was seeking to obtain a postal vote. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Flintshire County Council had failed to comply with standard 64.

complainant did not receive a Welsh language service as desired on 7 June, but did receive a full service in English by staff members at the reception. The Commissioner therefore is of the opinion that the complainant, in requiring a Welsh language service, was treated less favourably than had he required a reception service in English.

#### **Commissioner's determination**

Commissioner's determination Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: The Commissioner determined that the City of Cardiff Council has failed to comply with Standard 64 in this instance.

#### **Statement of further action**

Further action was taken in respect of the Council's failure to comply with standards 64.

#### **Statement on the further action**

In terms of the Commissioner's determination that the Council has failed to comply with standard 64, the Council is required to take the following steps in order to prevent the failure being repeated: The City of Cardiff Council must prepare an action plan in order to ensure that the Council makes available a Welsh language reception service, including informing a person that a Welsh language service is available, in order to comply with standard 64. The City of Cardiff Council must prepare an action plan in order to ensure that reception staff at the Council's main reception can provide a Welsh language reception service so that visitors do not have to turn to

English to receive a reception service, in order to comply with standard 64. The City of Cardiff Council must prepare an action plan in order to ensure that arrangements are put in place by the Council to ensure that a person who requires a Welsh language reception does not have to wait longer for a reception service than a person who requires an English language reception service. The City of Cardiff Council must prepare an action plan in order to review its linguistic requirements in relation to reception posts as outlined in the Council's Linguistic Skills Strategy, to ensure that reception staff possess the appropriate linguistic requirements to provide a Welsh language reception service in relation to enquiries by individuals visiting the Council's main reception.

**Decision notice given**

The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 01/03/2017.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Vale of Glamorgan Council

Description of the investigation The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public that satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint was regarding information on the Vale of Glamorgan Council website in relation to 2016 summer activities. The complaint stated: - that a link on the website's English language homepage

1/3/2017

**Commissioner's findings**

The Council confirmed that the Welsh version of the PDF document which included information on all the summer activities had only been published on the English language 'Summer Activities 2016' page. The Council stated that this was 'an error on the part of the page editor but that it was rectified once attention was drawn to it'. The Commissioner believes that failing to publish the Welsh version of the document on the appropriate Welsh language page equates to treating the document less

went to the 'Summer Activities 2016' page (which contained dedicated information regarding summer activities), but that the equivalent link on the Welsh language homepage took the user to the 'Beth sy'n digwydd' page (a more general events page, with less information about summer activities), even though the 'Gweithgareddau Haf 2016' page was available on the Welsh version of the website; - that the information on the 'Gweithgareddau Haf 2016' page was not complete, compared with the 'Summer Activities 2016' page; - that a Welsh language PDF document, containing information about all the summer activities, had been placed on the 'Summer Activities 2016' page but not on the 'Gweithgareddau Haf 2016' page. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standards 48 and 52.

favourably than the English version, as individuals using the Welsh language website would not be aware of the availability of the document. Individuals using the English language website would come across the English version of the document. When the Commissioner looked at the website on 15/08/2016, I found that the Council's 'Youth Centres' web page was not available in Welsh. Like all other pages on the Council's website, this web page should be available in Welsh in order to comply with standard 52. The Council confirmed that a link to the 'Beth sy'n digwydd' page had been placed on the website homepage instead of a link to the 'Gweithgareddau Haf 2016' page. This was an error which was rectified once the matter was brought to the Council's attention. The Commissioner believes that providing a link to the wrong page equates to treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language on the website, as individuals using the Welsh language website would not be directed to the appropriate information.

#### **Commissioner's determination**

Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standards 48 and 52.

#### **Statement of further action**

The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 Welsh Language Measure.

#### **Statement on the further action**

The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the

failure: Standard 48: The Commissioner requires that Vale of Glamorgan Council, within 40 working days (by 27/04/2017), ensures that any documents that need to be produced in Welsh are produced in Welsh, and that any Welsh language versions of documents are not treated less favourably than English language versions. Standard 52: The Commissioner requires that Vale of Glamorgan Council, within 40 working days (by 27/04/2017), ensures that it complies with standard 52 in relation to the text of each page on its website, the functioning of Welsh language pages on its website, and not treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language on its website.

**Decision notice given**

The decision notice was presented to the Council on 01/03/2017.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the tribunal.

Vale of Glamorgan Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public that satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint stated that the 'Updated Policy for the Appointment of LA Governors' document, which was on the 'Swyddi Llywodraethwyr Awdurdod Lleol (ALI)' page on the Vale of Glamorgan Council website, and on the English version of that page, was not available in

1/3/2017

**Commissioner's findings**

The Council has not argued that the document should not be produced in Welsh based on the fact that the document's subject matter and audience suggests that it should not do so. The Commissioner believes that the document's subject matter and audience suggests that it should be produced in Welsh. The Council stated that the failure to publish the Welsh language document on the website at the same time as the English version was an 'administrative error' and that this was rectified immediately once the Council became aware that the was

Welsh. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standard 47.

no Welsh language document was not there. As a Welsh language version of the document was not published until 16/09/2016, and an English version of the document had been published on 02/09/2016, the Council was not complying with the standard during the period when the document was only available in English.

#### **Commissioner's determination**

Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 47

#### **Statement of further action**

The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 Welsh Language Measure.

#### **Statement on the further action**

Statement on the further action The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure: The Commissioner requires that Vale of Glamorgan Council, within 40 working days (by 27/04/2017), establishes procedures and processes for assessing the need to produce documents in Welsh, for ensuring that any documents that need to be produced in Welsh are produced in Welsh, and for ensuring that any Welsh language versions of documents are not treated less favourably than English language versions. If such procedures and procedures are already in place, they should be reviewed.

#### **Decision notice given**

The decision notice was presented to the Council on 01/03/2017.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the tribunal

Description of the investigation The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public that satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint was regarding information about Planning on the Vale of Glamorgan Council website. Specifically, it was stated that the Development and Building Control Registers, and the 'A Guide to Planning in the Vale of Glamorgan' document, were not available in Welsh. There are links to the register and the document on the 'Cynllunio a Rheolaeth Adeiladu' page on the Council website, and on the English version of that page. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standards 47 and 52.

1/3/2017

**Commissioner's findings**

The Council has not argued that the document should not be produced in Welsh based on the fact that the document's subject matter and audience suggests that it should not do so. The Commissioner believes that the document's subject matter and audience suggests that it should be produced in Welsh. As an English version of the document is available, but a Welsh version of the document is not available, the Council is not complying with standard 47, and this has been the case since the imposition day for the standard. The Council stated that the Development and Building Control Registers had been available in English 'for a number of years', but that they were not available in Welsh. The Registers are now available in Welsh. I am of the opinion that the registers constitute pages on the Council's website and that, therefore, in order to comply with standard 52, they should have been available in Welsh.

**Commissioner's determination**

Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standards 47 and 52.

**Statement of further action**

Vale of Glamorgan Council



The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 Welsh Language Measure.

**Statement on the further action**

The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure: Standard 47: The Commissioner requires that Vale of Glamorgan Council, within 40 working days (by 27/04/2017), establishes procedures and processes for assessing the need to produce documents in Welsh, for ensuring that any documents that need to be produced in Welsh are produced in Welsh, and for ensuring that any Welsh language versions of documents are not treated less favourably than English language versions. If such procedures and procedures are already in place, they should be reviewed. Standard 52: The Commissioner requires that Vale of Glamorgan Council, within 40 working days (by 27/04/2017), ensures that it complies with standard 52 in relation to the text of each page on its website, the functioning of Welsh language pages on its website, and not treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language on its website.

**Decision notice given**

The decision notice was presented to the Council on 01/03/2017.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the tribunal.

The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public that satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint stated that all the text on the 'Swyddi Gwag Cyfredol' page on the Vale of Glamorgan Council website was not available in Welsh, and that the Welsh text within individual job advertisements was positioned below the English text. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standard 52.

1/3/2017

### **Commissioner's findings**

The Commissioner does not believe that the Welsh text needs to be placed above the English text or to the left of it in order to comply with the standard. In terms of not treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language, the Commissioner believes that placing the Welsh and English languages on separate pages could be more effective, but the Council is not failing to comply with the standard by placing the English text above the Welsh text.

### **Commissioner's determination**

Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 52.

### **Statement of further action**

The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 Welsh Language Measure.

### **Statement on the further action**

The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure: The Commissioner requires that Vale of Glamorgan Council, within 40 working days (by 27/04/2017), ensures that it complies with standard 52 in relation to the text of each page on its website, the functioning of Welsh language pages on its website, and not treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language on its website.

### **Decision notice given**

The Commissioner received a complaint on 30/03/2016 from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleged that the Council did not provide swimming lessons through the medium of Welsh beyond Wave 2 lessons at Mold Leisure Centre. The complainant alleged that the leisure centre's receptionist explained that a comprehensive programme of Wave 1 and 2 swimming lessons were available through the medium of Welsh but that there were no Wave 3 and 4 lessons available through the medium of Welsh. Furthermore, the complainant alleged that the leisure centre did not have a plan in place to provide lessons beyond Wave 2 in the future. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Flintshire County Council had failed to comply with standards 84 and 86.

15/2/2017

The decision notice was presented to the Council on 01/03/2017.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the tribunal.

**Commissioner's findings**

The Council explained that the current programme of swimming lessons had been available since October 2015. The swimming lessons concerned do not represent a course developed since the imposition date (30 March 2016), therefore the Commissioner concluded that the Council was not required to conduct nor publish an assessment on this occasion, and standard 86 is not considered relevant in this instance. The Commissioner understands that the Council has been offering the current programme of swimming lessons since October 2015 and therefore the Commissioner concludes that the Council was not required to assess nor publish the assessment of the need for swimming lessons through the medium of Welsh on its website on this occasion. The Council has confirmed that it does not provide swimming lessons through the medium of Welsh beyond Wave 2 at Mold Leisure Centre, but that it does provide swimming lessons through the medium of beyond Wave 2 at other locations in the County. The Commissioner is of the opinion that a Council does not have to provide swimming lessons through the medium of Welsh in every leisure centre as a matter of course in order to meet the requirements of standard 84. The standard, as it stands, does not require the Council to provide a course through the medium of Welsh at the same location nor the same

number of times as swimming lessons provided through the medium of English.

**Commissioner's determination**

Under section 73 (2) of the Welsh language Measure, the Commissioner has determined as follows: The Commissioner determined that the Council did not fail to comply with standard 86. The Commissioner determined that the Council did fail to comply with standard 84.

**Statement of further action**

Further action was taken in respect of the Council's failure to comply with standard 84

**Statement on the further action**

In terms of the Commissioner's determination that the Council has failed to comply with standard 84, the Council is required to take the following steps in order to prevent the failure being repeated, in accordance with section 79(1)(b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure: Flintshire County Council must ensure that its staff offer and provide information to the public on swimming lessons through the medium of Welsh provided by the Council. In this regard standard 81 should be implemented. Flintshire County Council must instruct staff on how to offer and provide information relating to the provision of swimming lessons available through the medium of Welsh so that anyone making enquiries about swimming lessons through the medium of Welsh are provided with specific information regarding such provision within the County. In terms of the Commissioner's determination that the Council did not

failed to comply with standard 86, no further action will be taken.

**Decision notice given**

The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 15/02/2017.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Welsh Ministers

The Commissioner received a complaint from a person on 20/04/2016 that met the conditions of section 93 (3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleged that there was an issue with the planning forms on the Planning Portal website which meant that it was not possible to submit a planning application to the local authority through the medium of Welsh. The complainant also alleged that much of the Welsh content found on the Planning Portal website was incorrect. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not Welsh Ministers had failed to comply with standards 50, 50A, 50B, 52 and 55.

20/12/2016

**Commissioner's findings**

Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that it was possible to complete an interactive version of the planning application form during April 2016. Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that headings appeared in Welsh on forms completed online and then printed. Welsh Ministers declared that a form which could be printed and completed by hand in Welsh was available during the period in question. Welsh Ministers did not ensure that all versions of planning application forms were available in Welsh on the Planning Portal website during the period in question. As two pages of an interactive or online planning application form on the Planning Portal website failed to contain the statement "Gweld y dudalen hon yn Gymraeg", Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that the English language version clearly stated that the form was also available in Welsh. By not providing fully functional forms and by not providing Welsh language headings on Welsh language versions of planning forms, Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than the English language version. By not providing Welsh language versions of all planning forms which are the

responsibility of Welsh Ministers, Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that the Welsh language version is treated no less favourably than the English language version. By failing to provide all the information which is the responsibility of Welsh Ministers in Welsh on the Planning Portal website, Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that the text on each page was available in Welsh on the Planning Portal website. In acknowledging that not all Welsh language pages, and specifically a Welsh language interactive planning application form, were fully functional on the Planning Portal website, Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that every page was fully functional on the Planning Portal website. In acknowledging that there were errors in Welsh, and that it was not possible to choose a Welsh language version of the interactive planning application form on the Planning Portal website, Welsh Ministers failed to ensure that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably on the Planning Portal website. By failing to provide a direct link to Welsh language pages from two corresponding English language pages, Welsh Ministers failed to clearly note that the page was also available in Welsh.

#### **Commissioner's determination**

Commissioner's determination Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Commissioner's determination on failure to comply with standards 50, 50A, 50B, 52 and 55.

#### **Statement of further action**

Further action was taken in respect of Welsh Ministers' failure to comply with standards 50, 50A, 50B, 52 and 55.

**Statement on the further action**

In terms of my determination that Welsh Ministers has failed to comply with standards 50, 50A 50B, 52 and 55, Welsh Ministers is required to take the following steps in order to prevent the failure to comply with the standards from continuing or being repeated, in accordance with section 79(1)(b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure: The Welsh Ministers must comply with standards 50, 50A, 50B, 52 and 55. These steps are to be implemented within 28 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

**Decision notice given**

The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 20/12/16  
Appeals made to the tribunal

**Appeals made to the Tribunal**

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

City and County  
of Swansea  
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The Complainant alleged that that he was not greeted in Welsh having telephoned the Council's main telephone line on 01792 636000, on 30 March 2016 at 12.25pm. The complainant alleges that he was not asked whether he wished to receive a service in Welsh and that there was a delay before he was transferred to a

21/11/2016

**Commissioner's findings**

The Council did not greet the complainant in Welsh when he contacted the Council on its main telephone line 30/3/16. The Council did not inform the complainant that a Welsh language service is available when he contacted the Council on its main telephone line 30/3/16. The Council did not deal with the complainants call in Welsh as was the complainants wish. The use of Welsh on the Council's Facebook page is limited. A high percentage of posts and texts that appear on the Council's Facebook page appear in English only. The Council published two

Welsh speaker. The complainant also alleges that it is not possible to view Welsh language content on the Council's Facebook page via the mobile phone app. In addition, it is alleged that official notices on the Public Notices website and in the South Wales Evening Post (specific reference is made to the notice on planning developments which appeared on 4 April, 2016 in the Evening Post) appeared in English only. The information raised suspicions that the Council had failed to comply with the Welsh language standards. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standards 8, 9, 11, 58 a 69.

official notices in English only in the South Wales Evening Post on 4/4/16.

#### **Commissioner's determination**

Under section 73(2) of the Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner determined that the Council had failed to comply with standards 8, 9, 11, 58 a 69.

#### **Statement of further action**

Further action was taken in respect of the Council's failure to comply with standards 58 and 69, but no further action was taken in respect of the Council's failure to comply with standards 8, 9 and 11.

#### **Statement on the further action**

In terms of my determination that the Council has failed to comply with standard 58 by treating the Welsh language less favourably than the English language on its Facebook page, the Council is required to take the following steps in order to prevent the failure to comply with standard 58 from continuing or being repeated, in accordance with section 79(1)(b)(ii) of the Welsh Language Measure: The City and County of Swansea Council must ensure that every message and text that appear on the Council's social media accounts appears in Welsh in order that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English language. The City and County of Swansea Council must ensure that messages and text that appear on the Council's social media accounts does not treat the Welsh Language less favourably than the English language. These steps are to be implemented within 28 days of issuing the



Commissioner's final determination. In terms of my determination that the Council has failed to comply with standards 8, 9 and 11 by failing to provide a greeting in Welsh, identifying the availability of a service in Welsh and dealing with the telephone call in Welsh until the call was transferred, I will not be taking any further action. This is because I am satisfied that a system is now in place to deal with telephone calls in Welsh and that guidance has been prepared for staff that deal with those calls in order to comply with the standards.

**Decision notice given**

The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 21/11/16.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Carmarthenshire  
County Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleged that the Welsh text displayed on a sign that has been erected by the CWM Environmental recycling centre at Nantycaws, Carmarthen is inaccurate. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had

21/11/2016

**Commissioner's findings**

The Welsh text on the sign in question is not grammatically correct. As a result, the Welsh language is treated less favourably than the English language. The sign was erected before 30 March, 2016 which is the imposition day for the standard.

**Commissioner's determination**

Under section 73(2) of the Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner determined that the Council had not failed to comply with standard 61, but that the Council had failed to comply with standard 63.

**Statement of further action**

failed to comply with standards 61 and 63.

In terms of the determination that Carmarthenshire County Council has not failed to comply with standard 61 as the sign in question was erected before 30 March 2016, no further action was taken. In terms of the determination that Carmarthenshire County Council has failed to comply with standard 63 further action was taken.

**Statement on the further action**

In terms of the determination that Carmarthenshire County Council has failed to comply with standard 63 the Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure to comply with the standard: Carmarthenshire County Council must erect a new sign that is accurate in terms of meaning and expression at the CWM Environmental Waste centre, in Nantycaws, Carmarthen. Carmarthenshire County Council must ensure that the Welsh text on signs at its environmental centres are accurate in terms of meaning and expression.

**Decision notice given**

The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 21/11/16.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Cardiff Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a person on 11/04/2016 that met the conditions of section 93 (3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complaint raises suspicion that Cardiff

10/11/2016

**Commissioner's findings**

By failing to transfer the telephone call to the planning department on a direct line number to a Welsh speaker, the Council did not deliver a telephone service through the medium of Welsh in its entirety. The Council did not

City Council has failed to comply with a standard. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to determine whether there was a failure by Cardiff City Council to comply with standards 18 and 20.

ensure that the Welsh language is not treated less favourably than the English by providing an English only greeting.

#### **Commissioner's determination**

Under section 73(2) of the Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner determined as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 18. The Council has failed to comply with standard 20.

#### **Statement of further action**

The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure.

#### **Statement on the further action**

The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the failure from continuing or being repeated: i. The Council must put arrangements in place in the Planning department to provide a Welsh language service in its entirety (if necessary by transferring the call to a member of staff who is able to deal with the call in Welsh) in order to comply with standard 18. Those arrangements must include providing a Welsh language service when greeting the person and, when necessary, by conveying a message that the call is being transferred to a member of staff who is able to deal with the call in Welsh. ii. The Council must raise awareness in the planning department of the steps they are required to take to transfer calls in order to comply with standard 18. iii. The Council must ensure that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language

when greeting a person by ensuring that a Welsh greeting which corresponds to the English greeting is given when a person contacts the planning department on a direct line number, in order to comply with standard 20. These steps are to be implemented within 28 days of issuing the Commissioner's final determination.

**Decision notice given**

The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 10/11/16.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the Tribunal

Cardiff Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The Complainant alleged that an operator on the Connect 2 Cardiff telephone line (02920 872088) offered that the complainant speak to an operator in English in order to get a faster service. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standards 9, 10 and 17.

10/11/2016

**Commissioner's findings**

By providing a dedicated Welsh language telephone line and by giving the complainant the option of staying on the line or to receive a return phone call from a Customer Services Representative who was able to speak Welsh and deal with the subject of the enquiry, the City of Cardiff Council succeeded in informing the complainant that a Welsh language service was available on 25/4/16. The Council dealt with the complainant's call in Welsh in its entirety on 25 April, 2016. The Council provided a Welsh language telephone service on the Connect 2 Cardiff Welsh telephone line on 25/4/16.

**Commissioner's determination**

Under section 73(2) of the Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner determined that the Council had not failed to comply with standards 9, 10 and 17.

**Statement of further action**

	<p>The Commissioner took further action in accordance with section 76 of the Welsh Language Measure.</p> <p><b>Statement on the further action</b> The Commissioner made the following recommendation to the Council: The Council should not encourage customers who contact a Welsh language telephone line and/or chose to receive a Welsh language service to accept an English language service.</p> <p><b>Decision notice given</b> The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 10/11/16.</p> <p><b>Appeals made to the tribunal</b> No appeal was made to the Tribunal</p>
<p><u>Cardiff Council</u></p> <p>The Commissioner received a complaint from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleged that English only temporary signs had been erected in Bute Park, Cardiff, and on Caerphilly Road, Cardiff. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standard 61.</p> <p>26/10/2016</p>	<p><b>Commissioner's findings</b> The Council placed English only temporary signs, and failed to display corresponding Welsh text in the Cardiff area after 30/3/16.</p> <p><b>Commissioner's determination</b> Under section 73(2) of the Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner determined as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 61.</p> <p><b>Statement of further action</b> The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure.</p> <p><b>Statement on the further action</b></p>

		<p>The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the failure from continuing or being repeated: City of Cardiff Council must take steps to i. ensure that any text displayed on temporary signs that are erected on or after the imposition day of standard 61 must be displayed in Welsh (either on the same sign that displays the corresponding text in English or on a separate sign). ii. ensure that the Welsh text is not treated less favourably than the English text if the same text is displayed in Welsh and English. These steps are to be implemented by 30 November 2016.</p> <p><b>Decision notice given</b> The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 26/10/16.</p> <p><b>Appeals made to the tribunal</b> No appeal was made to the Tribunal.</p>
<p><u>Cardiff Council</u></p> <p>The Commissioner received a complaint from a person which satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleged that English only temporary signs had been erected in Bute Park, Cardiff, and on Caerphilly Road, Cardiff. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standard 61.</p>	<p>26/10/2016</p>	<p><b>Commissioner's findings</b> The Council placed English only temporary signs, and failed to display corresponding Welsh text in the Cardiff area after 30/3/16.</p> <p><b>Commissioner's determination</b> Under section 73(2) of the Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner determined as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 61.</p> <p><b>Statement of further action</b></p>

The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 of the Welsh Language Measure.

**Statement on the further action**

The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the failure from continuing or being repeated: City of Cardiff Council must take steps to i. ensure that any text displayed on temporary signs that are erected on or after the imposition day of standard 61 must be displayed in Welsh (either on the same sign that displays the corresponding text in English or on a separate sign). ii. ensure that the Welsh text is not treated less favourably than the English text if the same text is displayed in Welsh and English. These steps are to be implemented by 30 November 2016.

**Decision notice given**

The Decision Notice was given to the Council on 26/10/16.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the Tribunal.

Wrexham  
County Borough  
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public that satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleges that there was no Welsh speaker available on reception at the Guildhall, Wrexham when he visited the reception on 1/4/16. The

19/10/2016

**Commissioner's findings**

When the complainant visited the reception, he was unable to receive a Welsh language service, although it was possible to receive the reception service in English. The complainant was treated less favourably than a person wishing to receive an English language reception service by having to wait for a longer length of time in order to receive a Welsh language service.

complainant alleges that he was informed by the customer advisor working on reception that he would have to wait for another member of staff to return to the reception area before he could be provided with a Welsh language service. The complainant alleges that a full and prompt service was available to anyone who wished to receive an English language service. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standard 64.

#### **Commissioner's determination**

Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 64.

#### **Statement of further action**

The Commissioner decided to take further action in accordance with section 77 Welsh Language Measure.

#### **Statement on the further action**

The Council is required to take the following steps for the purpose of preventing the continuation or repetition of the failure: Wrexham County Borough Council must: i. Arrange the reception service at the Guildhall, Wrexham, so that staff absences from the reception does not lead to a failure by the Council to comply with standard 64. ii. Ensure that sufficient members of staff that can provide a Welsh language service are available in the reception at the Guildhall, Wrexham in order to comply with standard 64 and make available a Welsh language reception service if it is also available in English at all times. These steps are to be implemented within 28 days of the date of submitting the final report on the investigation.

#### **Decision notice given**

The decision notice was presented to the Council on 19/10/16.

#### **Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the tribunal.



Caerphilly  
County Borough  
Council

The Commissioner received a complaint from a member of the public that satisfied the conditions of section 93(3) to (6) of the Welsh Language Measure. The complainant alleged that the use of the slogan "yn barod i'w renti" and the hashtag #GweithioiGaerffili on the Council's facebook pages is incorrect. The complainant also alleged that the use of "Ystafelloedd Newid Dan Do" on signage displayed in leisure centres is also incorrect. The complaint raised doubts about the Council's compliance with the standards. The Commissioner decided to undertake an investigation under section 71 of the Welsh Language Measure in order to ascertain whether or not the Council had failed to comply with standards 58 and 63.

20/9/2016

### **Commissioner's findings**

In using the incorrect term "rhenti" instead of "rhentu" on Facebook, the Council has treated the Welsh language less favourably than the English language when using social media. In using the hashtag "GweithioiGaerffili" the Council did not treat the Welsh language less favourably than the English language when using social media as it correctly corresponds to the English version #WorkforCaerphilly In using "Ystafelloedd Newid Dan Do" on signage displayed in leisure centres, the Council used a standard term widely used in relation to sport and leisure. Commissioner's determination Under Section 73(2) Welsh Language Measure the Commissioner's determination is as follows: The Council has failed to comply with standard 58 in using the term "rhenti" The Council has not failed to comply with standard 58 in using the hashtag #GweithioiGaerffili The Council has not failed to comply with standard 63 in using the term "ystafelloedd newid dan do" on signage in leisure centres

### **Statement of further action**

The Commissioner decided to take no further action in accordance with section 76 and 77 of the Welsh Language Measure.

### **Statement on the further action**

In respect of the determination that the Council has failed to comply with standard 58 in using the term "rhenti" instead of "rhentu" on social media, the Commissioner will not be taking any further action in accordance with section 77(2) (a) Welsh Language (Wales) Measure) 2011 That is because the Commissioner is satisfied that an error by an

individual was responsible for this failure and no evidence has been presented of other similar errors. The Commissioner is therefore satisfied that the Council has sufficient arrangements in place for publishing Welsh language text which is grammatically correct on social media. In respect of the determination that the Council has not failed to comply with standard 58 in using the hashtag #GweithioiGaerffili, the Commissioner will not be taking any further action. In respect of the determination that the Council has not failed to comply with standard 63 in using the term "ystafelloedd newid dan do" on signage, the Commissioner will not be taking any further action.

**Decision notice given**

The decision notice was presented to the Council on 20/09/16.

**Appeals made to the tribunal**

No appeal was made to the tribunal